POLS 8060 Baldwin 404

Fall 2022 542-2922

Alexander Kaufman akaufman@uga.edu

*Systems in Political Philosophy*

*Social Justice*

Inequalities of income and employment opportunity; deprivations arising from poverty and disability; the sufferings of victims of oppression--all of these are routinely denounced as *unjust*. What fundamental interests must an acceptable theory of justice protect? What is the legitimate jurisdiction of such a theory?

Since the publication of Rawls's *A Theory of Justice* in 1971, the question has been the subject of a continuous stream of articles, monographs and extended studies. Robert Nozick, Richard Arneson, G. A. Cohen, Ronald Dworkin, Martha Nussbaum, and Amartya Sen have contributed seminal work during the 1980s, 1990s, and 2000s.

This course will explore the theoretical basis for claims about justice. When we claim that a policy is unjust, what kind of a judgment are we making? If a policy is unjust, what reason does that give us to oppose the policy? Should the rules and institutions that govern the distribution of social goods be designed to maximize social utility; or does justice require rules and institutions that can be justified to the persons who are subject to the rules? What kind of arguments might such persons be willing to accept? The course will focus on the works of John Rawls, the leading contemporary theorist of justice, and will examine contrasting views in the work of Robert Nozick, Elizabeth Anderson, Richard Arneson, G.A. Cohen, Ronald Dworkin, Samuel Scheffler, and Amartya Sen.

These texts are available at the University Bookstore:

John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice* (Harvard University Press)

Robert Nozick, *Anarchy, State and Utopia* (Basic Books)

I.  *Justice as Fairness*

A23 *Introduction*

A30 *A Theory of Justice*, pp. 3-46

Thomas Nagel, "Rawls on Justice," pp. 1-16

Ronald Dworkin, "The Original Position," pp. 16-53

Norman Daniels, "Wide reflective equilibrium and theory acceptance in ethics," pp. 21-40

Joshua Cohen, “For a Democratic Society,” pp 86-138

T. M. Scanlon, “Rawls on Justification,” pp. 139-167

Alexander Kaufman, Rawls and Kantian Constructivism,” pp. 227-56.

Anthony Simon Laden, “Constructivism as Rhetoric,” pp. 59-72.

Stemplowska and Swift, “Rawls on Ideal and Nonideal Theory,” pp.

112-27.

Samuel Freeman, “The Basic Structure of Society as the Primary

Subject of Justice,” 88-111.

S6 *A Theory of Justice,* pp. 47-93

T. M. Scanlon, "Rawls's Theory of Justice," pp. 169-205

G. A. Cohen, "Where the Action Is: On the Site of Distributive Justice"

Norman Daniels, “Democratic Equality,” pp. 241-276

Thomas E. Hill, “Stability, A Sense of Justice, and Self-Respect,”

pp. 200-215.

S13 *A Theory of Justice,* pp. 102-139, 144-149, 153-160

Allen Buchanan, "The Unsoundness of the Maximin Argument", pp. 26-35

Joshua Cohen, "Democratic Equality," pp. 727-751

Alexander Kaufman, “A Satisfactory Minimum Conception of

 Justice: Reconsidering Rawls's Maximin Argument,” pp. 349-69.

S20 Rawls Overview

 Income Distribution and Justice

 Handout

II.  *Entitlement Theory*

S27 *Anarchy, State and Utopia*, pp. ix-xvi, 3-25, 149-167

O4 *Anarchy, State and Utopia*, pp. 167-213

O11 *Anarchy, State and Utopia*, pp. 213-232

*III. Equality of What?*

O18Dworkin, R. "What is Equality? Part 2: Equality of Resources" (1981b), *Philosophy and Public Affairs 10* (1981), pp. 283-345.

O25 PAPER PROPOSAL DUE

 Sen, A. "Equality of What", in *The Tanner Lectures on Human Values*, vol. 1, S. M. McMurrin (ed.) (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1980), Pp. 195-220.

Sen, A. "Well-Being, Agency and Freedom: The Dewey Lectures 1984", *Journal of Philosophy* 82 (1985), Pp. 169-220.

N1 Arneson, R. "Equality and Equal Opportunity for Welfare", *Philosophical Studies* 56 (1989): 77-93.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ "Liberalism, Distributive Subjectivism, and Equal Opportunity for Welfare", *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 19 (1990): 158-94.

N8 PAPER DRAFT DUE

Cohen, G. A. "On the Currency of Egalitarian Justice", *Ethics 99* (1989), 906-944.

Cohen, G. A. "Equality of What? On Welfare, Goods and Capabilities", *Recherches economiques de Louvain 56* (1990): 358-381.

III. *Relational Equality*

N15 Anderson, E. "What is the Point of Equality?", *Ethics* 109 (1999): 287-337.

N29 Scheffler, S. "What is Egalitarianism", *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 31/1 (Winter 2003): 5-39.

D13 Final Paper Due

*Requirements*

The course will be conducted in a seminar format. It is imperative that students come to class well-prepared to discuss the readings. The grade will be based on class participation (including one presentation) (25%), weekly submission of research issues, and a 12-15 page paper (75%), due the last class meeting, and addressing issues discussed in the course and readings. A paper proposal will be due on October 12; and a draft should be submitted for comments on November 9.

**The course syllabus is a general plan for the course; deviations announced to the class by the instructor may be necessary.**

*Grades*

The paper will constitute 80% of the course grade. Participation in discussion will constitute 20% of the grade. The instructor reserves the right to raise the letter grades of students who have participated exceptionally well over the course of the semester. Attendance is mandatory, and the instructor reserves the right to make up to a ten percent reduction in the overall paper grade in the case of poor attendance. Assignments handed in late will be subject to significant grading penalties.

Finally, you are bound by the University's conduct regulations concerning academic honesty. In the context of this course, the inaccurate presentation of written materials as your original work would constitute academic dishonesty. All academic work must meet the standards contained in a culture of honesty. Students are responsible for informing themselves about those standards before performing any academic work.

*Selective Bibliography*

Anderson, Elizabeth. 1999. “What is the Point of Equality?” *Ethics* 99/2: 287-337.

Arneson, Richard. 1989. "Equality and Equal Opportunity for Welfare", *Philosophical Studies* 56: 77-93.

Arneson, Richard. 1989. "Introduction to *Symposium on Rawlsian Theory of Justice: Recent Developments*." *Ethics* 99 (July): 695-710.

Arneson, Richard. 1990. "Liberalism, Distributive Subjectivism, and Equal Opportunity for Welfare", *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 19: 158-94.

Arneson, Richard. 2000. "Luck Equality and Prioritarianism", *Ethics* 110: 339-349.

Baier, Kurt. 1989. "Justice and the Aims of Philosophy." *Ethics* 99 (July): 771-90.

Barry, Brian. 1995. "John Rawls and the Search for Stability." *Ethics 105 (July): 874-915.*

Brooks, Thom, and Freyenhagen, Fabian, eds. 2005. *The Legacy of John Rawls.* London: Continuum.

Buchanan, Allen. 1975. "Revisability and Rational Choice." *Canadian Journal of Philosophy 5: 395-408.*

Buchanan, Allen. 1980. "A Critical Introduction to Rawls' Theory of Justice," in Blocker, H. G. and Smith, E. H., eds. *John Rawls' Theory of Social Justice: An Introduction.* Athens: Ohio State Press.

Chambers, Simone. 1996.  *Reasonable Democracy: Jurgen Habermas and the Politics of Discourse.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Charney, Evan. 1998. "Political Liberalism, Deliberative Democracy, and the Public Sphere." *American Political Science Review* 92 (March): 97-110.

Cohen, G. A. 1989. "On the Currency of Egalitarian Justice", *Ethics 99*: 906-944.

Cohen, G. A. 1990. "Equality of What? On Welfare, Goods and

Capabilities" *Recherches economiques de Louvain 56:* 357-82, reprinted in Nussbaum and Sen.

Cohen, G. A. 1993. "Equality of What? On Welfare, Resources and Capabilities." in Nussbaum and Sen.

Cohen, G. A. 1995. *Self-Ownership, Freedom and Equality*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Cohen, G. A. 2000. *If You’re an Egalitarian, How Come You’re So Rich?* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Cohen, G. A. 2000. "Where the Action Is: On the Site of Distributive Justice," in Cohen, G. A. *If You're an Egalitarian, How Come You're So Rich? Cambridge: Harvard University Press.*

Cohen, G. A. 2008. *Rescuing Justice and Equality.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Cohen, G. A. 2011. *On the Currency of Egalitarian Justice, and Other Essays in Political Philosophy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011.

Cohen, Joshua. 1989. "Democratic Equality." *Ethics* 99 (July): 727-51.

Cohen, Joshua. 1993. "Moral Pluralism and Political Consensus." In *The Idea of Democracy*, ed. David Copp, Jean Hampton, and John Roemer. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Cohen, Joshua. 2003. “For a Democratic Society,” in Freeman, ed.

Daniels, Norman. 1979. "Wide Reflective Equilibrium and Theory Acceptance in Ethics." *Journal of Philosophy* 76 (May): 256-282.

Daniels, Norman, ed. 1989. *Reading Rawls: Critical Studies on Rawls' `A Theory of Justice.' Stanford: Stanford University Press.*

Daniels, Norman. 2000. "Reflective Equilibrium and Justice as Political," in Davion and Wolf.

Daniels, Norman. 2003. “Democratic Equality: Rawls’s Complex Egalitarianism,” in Freeman, ed.

Darwall, Stephen, ed. 1995. *Equal Freedom.* Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Davion, Victoria and Wolf, Clark, eds. 2000. *The Idea of a Political Liberalism: Essays on Rawls*. Boston: Rowman & Littlefield.

Doppelt, Gerald. 1989. "Is Rawls's Kantian Liberalism Coherent and Defensible?" *Ethics* 99 (July): 815-51.

Dworkin, Ronald. 1981. "What is Equality? Part 1: Equality of

Welfare." *Philosophy and Public Affairs 10*: 185-246.

Dworkin, Ronald. 1981. "What is Equality? Part 2: Equality of

Resources." *Philosophy and Public Affairs 10*: 283-345.

Dworkin, Ronald. 1987. "What is Equality? Part III: The Place of Liberty." *Iowa Law Review 73*: 1-54.

Dworkin, Ronald. 1987. "What is Equality? Part IV: Political Equality." *University of San Francisco Law Review* 22: 1-30.

Dworkin, Ronald. 1989. "The Original Position," in Daniels, ed.

Dworkin, Ronald. 1995. "Foundations of Liberal Equality", in Darwall, ed.: 190-306.

Dworkin, Ronald. "Autonomy and Politics", manuscript (1998)

Dworkin, Ronald. 2000. *Sovereign Virtue: The Theory and Practice of Equality.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Dworkin, Ronald. 2002. S*overeign Virtue* Revisited", *Ethics* 113: 106-143.

Dworkin, Ronald. 2003. "Equality, Luck and Hierarchy", *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 31/2: 190-198

Dworkin, Ronald. 2010. *Justice for Hedgehogs.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Estlund, David. 1998. "The Insularity of the Reasonable: Why Political Liberalism Must Admit the Truth." *Ethics* 108 (January): 252-275.

Freeman, Samuel. 1990. "Reason and Agreement in Social Contract Views." *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 19 (Spring): 122-57.

Freeman, Samuel. 1991. "Contractualism, Moral Motivation, and Practical Reason." *Journal of Philosophy* 88 (June): 281-303.

Freeman, Samuel. 1994. "Political Liberalism and the Possibility of a Just Democratic Constitution." *Chicago-Kent Law Review* 69: 619-668.

Freeman, Samuel, ed. 2003. *The Cambridge Companion to Rawls.* Cambridge: Camridge University Press.

Freeman, Samuel. *Justice and the Social Contract: Essays on Rawlsian Political Philosophy.* 2007. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Freeman, Samuel. 2007. *Rawls.* Oxford: Routledge.

Freeman, Samuel. 2014. “The Basic Structure of Society as the Prinary Subject of Justice,” in Mandle and Reidy (eds.), pp. 88-111.

Galston, William A. 1989. "Pluralism and Social Unity." *Ethics* 99 (July): 711-26.

Gaus, Gerald. 2014. “The Turn to Political Liberalism,” in Mandle and Reidy (eds.), pp. 235-50.

Habermas, Jurgen. 1995. "Reconciliation Through the Public Use of Reason: Remarks on John Rawls's Political Liberalism." *Journal of Philosophy* 92 (March).

Hampton, Jean. 1989. "Should Political Philosophy Be Done Without Metaphysics?" *Ethics* 99 (July): 791-815.

Hampton, Jean. 1994. "The Common Faith of Liberalism." *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly* 75: 186-216.

Hill, Thomas E. 1994. "The Stability Problem in Political Liberalism."  *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly* 75: 333-51.

Hill, Thomas E. 2014. “Stability, a Sense of Justice, and Self-Respect, in Mandle and Reidy (eds.), pp. 200-215.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2004. "Choice, Responsibility and Equality." *Political Studies* 52: 819-836.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2004. “The Myth of the Patterned Principle.” *Polity* 36/4 (July): 559-78.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2006. "Capabilities and Freedom." *Journal of Political Philosophy* 14: 3: 289-300.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2006.”Rawls’s Practical Conception of Justice: Opinion, Tradition and Objectivity in *Political Liberalism*.” *Journal of Moral Philosophy* 3/1: 23-43.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2009. Stability, Fit, and Consensus.” *Journal*

*of Politics* Volume *71*/2: 533-43.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2012. “Rawls and Kantian Constructivism.”

*Kantian Review* Volume 17/2: 227-56.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2013. “A Satisfactory Minimum Conception of

Justice: Reconsidering Rawls's Maximin Argument.” *Economics and Philosophy* Volume 29/3: 349-69.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2013. “Political Liberalism, Constructivism,

and Global Justice” *Journal of Moral Philosophy* Volume 10/5: 1-24.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2014. “Political Authority, Civil Disobedience,

Religion,” in Mandle and Reidy (eds.), pp. 216-32.

Kaufman, Alexander. 2018. *Rawls’s Egalitarianism.* Cambridge: Cambridge

University Press.

Klosko, George. 1994. "Rawls's Argument From Political Stability."  *Columbia Law Review* 94 (October): 1882-97.

Klosko, George. 1997. "Political Constructivism in Rawls'  *Political Liberalism*." *American Political Science Review* 91 (September): 635-46.

Kukathas, Chandran & Pettit, Philip. 1990. *Rawls: A Theory of Justice and Its Critics*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Laden, Anthony Simon. 2014. “Constructivism as Rhetoric, in Mandle and Reidy (eds.), pp. 59-72.

Larmore, Charles. 1990. "Political Liberalism." *Political Theory* 18 (August): 339-60.

Lloyd, S.A. 1994. "Relativizing Rawls." *Chicago-Kent Law Review* 69: 709-735.

Mandle, Jon and Reidy, David (eds.). 2014. *A Companion to Rawls.* Oxford: WILEY Blackwell.

Martin, Rex, and Reidy, David. 2006. *Rawls’s Law of Peoples: A Realistic Utopia?* Oxford: Routledge.

Mouffe, Chantal. 1996. "Democracy, Power, and the ‘Political’." In

*Democracy and Difference*, ed. S. Benhabib. Princeton: Princeton

University Press, pp. 245-256.

Nagel, Thomas. 1987. "Moral Conflict and Political Legitimacy." *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 16 (3), pp. 215-240.

Nagel, Thomas. 1989. "Rawls on Justice," in Daniels, ed.

Neal, Patrick. 1994. "Does He Mean What He Says? (Mis)Understanding

Rawls's Practical Turn." *Polity* 27/1: 77-111.

Nozick, Robert. 1974. *Anarchy, State, and Utopia*. New York: Basic Books.

Nussbaum, Martha. 1990. "Aristotelian Social Democracy", in R.B. Douglass, G.R. Mara and H.S. Richardson (eds.), *Liberalism and the Good.* New York: Routledge.

Nussbaum, Martha. "Human Functioning and Social Justice: In Defense of Aristotelian Essentialism." 1992. *Political Theory* 20: 202-246.

Nussbaum, Martha. 2000. *Women and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Nussbaum, Martha. 2011. *Creating Capabilities.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Nussbaum, Martha. 2003. “Rawls and Feminism,” in Freeman, ed.

Nussbaum, Martha and Sen, Amartya. 1993. *The Quality of Life.* Oxford: Clarendon.

O’Neill, Onora. 1988. "Ethical Reasoning and Ideological Pluralism." *Ethics 98 (July): 705-22.*

O’Neill, Onora. 1996. *Towards justice and virtue: A constructive account of practical reasoning.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

O’Neill, Onora. 2003. “Constructivism in Rawls and Kant,” in Freeman, ed.

Parfit, D. 1990. "On Giving Priority to the Worse Off", manuscript.

Pogge, Thomas W. 1989. *Realizing Rawls*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Pogge, Thomas W. 2007. *John Rawls: His Life and Theory of Justice.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rawls, John. 1951. "Outline of a Decision Procedure for Ethics." *Philosophical Review* 60: 177-97.

Rawls, John. 1971. *A Theory of Justice*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Rawls, John. 1980. "Kantian Constructivism in Moral Theory." *Journal of Philosophy 77*: 515-72.

Rawls, John. 1993, 1996. *Political Liberalism.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Rawls, John. 1999a. *Collected Papers.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Rawls, John. 1995. "Reply to Habermas." *Journal of Philosophy* 92: 372-434.

Rawls, John. 1999. *The Law of Peoples*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Rawls, John. 2001. *Justice as Fairness: A Restatement.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Raz, Joseph. 1990. "Facing Diversity: The Case of Epistemic Abstinence." *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 19 (Winter): 3-46.

Sandel, Michael J. 1982, 1998. *Liberalism and the Limits of Justice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Scanlon, T. M. 1982. "Contractualism and Utilitarianism," in *Utilitarianism and Beyond*, A. Sen and B. Williams, eds. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Scanlon, T. M. 1989. "Rawls' Theory of Justice," in Daniels, ed.

Scanlon, T. M. 1998. *What We Owe to Each Other.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Scanlon, T. M. 2003. “Rawls on Justification,” in Freeman, ed.

Scheffler, Samuel. 1994. "The Appeal of Political Liberalism." *Ethics 105: 4-22.*

Scheffler, Samuel. 2003. “What is Egalitarianism?”, *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 31/1: 5-39.

Scheffler, Samuel. 2003. "Equality as the Virtue of Sovereigns: A Reply to Dworkin", *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 31/2: 199-206.

Scheffler, Samuel. “Is the Basic Structure Basic?” in Sypnowich (2006): 102-129.

Scheffler, Samuel. 2010. *Equality & Tradition: Questions of Value in Moral and Political Theory.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sen, Amartya. 1973. *On Economic Inequality*. New York: Norton.

Sen, Amartya. 1980. "Equality of What", in *The Tanner Lectures on Human Values*, vol. 1, S.M.McMurrin, ed. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press: 195-220.

Sen, Amartya. 1985. "Well-Being, Agency and Freedom: The Dewey Lectures 1984", *Journal of Philosophy* 82: 169-220.

Sen, Amartya. 1985. *Commodities and Capabilities*. Amsterdam: North-

Holland.

Sen, Amartya. 1987. *The Standard of Living.* Cambridge: Cambridge

University Press.

Sen, Amartya. 1987. *On Ethics and Economics*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Sen, Amartya. 1993. *Inequality Reexamined*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Sen, Amartya. 1993. "Capability and Well-Being." in Nussbaum

and Sen.

Stemplowska, Zofia and Swift, Adam. 2014. “Rawls on Ideal and Nonideal Theory,” in Mandle and Reidy (eds.), pp. 112-27.

Sypnowich, Christine., ed. 2006. *The Egalitarian Conscience: Essays in Honor of G. A. Cohen.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Taylor, Robert S. 2005. “Self-Realization and the priority of fair equality of opportunity,” in Brooks and Freyenhagen.

Wenar, Leif. 1995. "*Political Liberalism*: An Internal Critique." *Ethics* 106 (October): 32-67.

Williams, Bernard. 1985. *Ethics and the Limits of Philosophy*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Wingenbach, Ed. 1999. "Unjust Context: The Priority of Stability in

Rawls's Contextualized Theory of Justice." *American Journal of*

*Political Science 43/1: 213-232.*

Wolf, Clark. 2000. "Fundamental Rights, Reasonable Pluralism, and the Moral Commitments of Liberalism," in Davion and Wolf.

Young, Iris Marion. 1995. "Rawls's *Political Liberalism*." *Journal of Political Philosophy* 3 (June): 181-90.